

**Addendum To Permit Application To:
*Allow On-Site Identification Signage at the 12th &
Hamilton Parking Garage***

SUBMITTED TO:

Robert N. Brown, Director
Cleveland City Planning Commission
rbrown@city.cleveland.oh.us
Tel: 216-664-3467 Fax: 216-664-3281
Web Site: <http://planning.city.cleveland.oh.us>

SUBMITTED BY:

E.V. Bishoff Company
David W. Bishoff
President
E.V. Bishoff Company
33 North Third Street
Suite 500
Columbus, OH 43215

PREPARED BY:

E. V. Bishoff Company
dbishoff@evbco.com

November 8, 2011

SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.1 Subject Property

This proposal is to supplement the current wind shield and identification signage permit application at the parking garage located at: 12th and Hamilton, Cleveland, OH.

This garage currently has no name, address or identification.

1.2 Purpose and Goals

E.V. Bishoff Company, and the City of Cleveland have been cooperatively engaged in discussions to install a “Weather Shield and Garage Identification Signage” at the subject property in an effort to protect the garage from further wear and tear from the elements due to the garages proximity to Lake Erie and the strong weather patterns that originate from the lake. As part of this concerted effort to stabilize and enhance the integrity of the garage, it has been brought to both parties attention that the garage currently is a focal point in the neighborhood and a building that serves both public, and professionals of the City of Cleveland, but also a parking facility that currently is not terribly attractive and does not have a name, address or any sort of identification. Therefore this facility has a considerable competitive disadvantage among other garages in the city that all have a name and identity in the attraction and retention parking tenants to sustain economic vitality in Cleveland.

The specific goals for the proposal include, but are not limited to:

- 1) Clearly demonstrate this type of sign can only be classified as an on-site Identification signage
- 2) Prove to the design review committee to allow for the size of such signs and design patterns on the wind shields at this location as a beautification effort for the blighted building.
- 3) Create a Weather Shield to protect the garage
- 4) Create, develop and enhance an identity for the garage,
- 5) Accommodate the demands of the Lead Garage Tenant which include naming the garage after them.
- 6) Attract additional tenant(s) for the garage.

1.3 Why This Location - Lake Erie Damage

The subject property sits in very close proximity to Lake Erie and therefore is highly subject to the extreme climate clusters generated by the lake. As a result, it has been evidenced that due to the proximity of the lake, the lack of surrounding buildings and the position of the neighboring buildings either the garage must be:

1. Remodeled and reconstructed with closed off sides to not allow a weather,
OR
2. A Weather Shield must be installed to protect the garage, and provide safety to the tenants and pedestrians from the wind and water infiltration

1.4 Why This Location – Reasons Unique To This Building

An important element to note is that from the standpoint of insuring that we are not creating a precedent that is easily criticized by others, the following unique characteristics exist with this structure that are very difficult to duplicate elsewhere and preclude this from being considered Off Premises Advertising. They include:

1. **Unique Structural Design:** From the standpoint of the weather shield, the location of this structure is such that it gets very little cover from surrounding buildings by way of the weather that permeates the exterior of the garage. This added to the fact that it sits directly across from the Erie View pedestrian walk way which acts as a wind tunnel and bringing in a tremendous amount of weather directly into the garage from both the Lake effect and the effect of the weather that is driven to the garage after being deflected off Erie View Tower.
2. **Lack Of Identify/Anchor Tenant:** From the standpoint of our choice of how to identify the garage, this report will show that the name is not a random name chosen simply advertise the product of an unrelated company through the use of the exterior of the garage. Quite the contrary. Just as any large client of another structure would ask for, and expect to get naming rights, so did Kia Motors as we discussed their ever growing relationship with the garage and its ownership.
3. **Unique Production/Design:** It should also be noted that the Identification of the garage is built into the Weather Shield making it nearly impossible to simply remove without removing the entire Weather Shield itself. The intertwining nature of the Weather Shield and the name of the garage was specifically created that way so as not to accommodate any marketing that would be considered transient billboard advertising.

4. **Enhance A Unattractive Building/Area:** It The Weather Shield has specifically been designed to add a colorful design to the exterior of the structure and add life to what is arguably a dreary side of downtown.
5. **Size And Position Of Name:** It should also be noted that due to points 1-3 above, the size and position of the name should be allowed at its current proposed size due to the need and design of the weather shield. If the size of Identification Sign is any different than proposed it will be lost in the design of the weather shield and will not serve its purpose.
6. **Not A Billboard:** The Weather Shield specifically DOES NOT contain any graphics that would promote anything other than the name of the structure itself.

SECTION 2: WHY THIS IS CLASSIFIED ONSITE SIGNAGE

2.1 Definitions

The best way to explain why the proposed signage must be classified as onsite signage, is to first explain the difference between on-site signage and off-site signage.

The following are definitions of off-site advertising mediums used as off-site advertising in (1) the advertising industry, and (2) the City of Cleveland Code Ordinances and therefore should be taken into consideration as part of this proposal.

Off Site Signage – Billboard/Wallscape/Wall Mural:

Standard Industry Definition: A sign or vinyl graphic installed and often switched out on a commercial building that is typically several stories tall, with a sign that covers at least 75% of the building face, with content that is more than 60% images, photographs, or artwork with at least 10% text, logos and tag lines for a product, service or brand that is sold or promoted off-premise with the objective of gaining increase buzz to the product that is not sold, operated, or related to the building it is attached to in some manner.

City of Cleveland Definition: A sign that displays high resolution static or electronic graphic or photographic images, including decorative art and art used in commerce, placed on an unsightly wall of a building, or unsightly roof surface generally parallel to the building wall surface. A wall mural may display words in accordance with Section [350.161](#) and otherwise shall comply with Section [350.161](#). A wall mural may depict or direct attention to a specific business, product, service, entertainment activity, or other activity. Wall murals shall not be deemed billboards or wall signs for purposes of [Chapters 350](#) and [341](#) of this Zoning Code and [Chapters 161](#), [303](#), [3113](#), and [317](#) of the Codified Ordinances.

Important Information To Note:

Off-site advertising signs often or always are:

- Intended to be replaced, switch out or changed (i.e. a copy change) every month or few months
- Promote a product or service that is not located related and/or not affiliated with the building it is attached too
- Contain images, pictures, and graphic illustrations of product and services being promoted – often these images dominate the signage area, and are intended to be nationally recognized.
- Generates revenue on a monthly basis on the signage rights of the structure only, and no other elements of the building it is on or attached too

The proposed Weather Shield and Identification signs are:

- **Not** Intended to be replaced, switch out or changed (i.e. a copy change) every month or few months, and in fact is scheduled to be in place long-term.
- **Identifies the name of major tenant/business partner**
- **Does not** contain images, pictures, and graphic illustrations
- **Does not** generate revenue on the sign rights (like a billboard), but on the other elements of lease the tenant as on the building.

Sample Wallscape/Wall Mural below





OnSite Signage – An Identification/Informational sign that is promoting, advertising or displaying something that is sold, related or affiliated to the building it is attached too.

2.2 Classifying the “Type” of the proposed signage – Using City of Cleveland Ordinances

IDENTIFICATION SIGNAGE:

“A sign identifying or naming a building, business, institution , residential development or other use and displaying such other information as the owner, manager and address of the use or building”.

The proposed sign is clearly an **Identification Sign** as it identifies the name of the building as to which it is affixed to - the garage. It describes the purpose of the garage as a Parking Center and displays information as to the main entity associated with the garage, KIA Motors.

2.3 Case Studies

The City of Cleveland has allowed this type of identification on many, if not all of the parking garages in the City. The following lists the names of various parking garages that have execute this type of signage

- Key Bank Garage
- Ohio Savings Garage
- Huntington Garage
- PNC Garage

It should be noted that in each of the cases outlined above, the name of the garage reflects the name of one of the many tenants in a surrounding or nearby building, and not in the garage it's self as such could be considered off-site signage. The Kia Motors identification signage is clearly a name chosen for a tenant that has contracted space inside the garage the name it attached to, and therefore clearly on-site signage. Furthermore, in none of the cases above is the lead tenant a significant portion of the building (over 50%), but in all cases above, the building and the garage have been named after the tenant. In some of the above cases, the named Tenant is accounts for less than 5% of the overall portion of the building and or the garage that they or their employees utilize. The same thought was given to the subject garage when we agreed to rename the garage after our lead tenant. Given the experience that the City of Cleveland already has with this type of Identification Signage there is no debating that the request of this proposal are following suit to what already is considered a norm in the city, and therefore quick permit approval is hoped for so that this project may move forward.

SECTION 3: WHY KIA MOTORS

3.1 Major Tenant – Significant Business Partner

The below outlines many of the reasons why E.V. Bishoff Company has agreed to name the garage **Kia Motors Parking Center**:

Kia Motors has leased a considerable amount of the total square footage of the garage.

Kia Motors is paying to reserve as much as 15% of the entire garage for downtown parking customers that drive a Kia automobile in an effort to create a “preferred parking” class for Kia automobile owners. We believe that this will not only drive revenue to the garage from our Lead Client (Kia) but will also attract the business from existing Kia Owners.

Kia Motors has leased parking spaces in the garage for their overflow parking needs for those automobiles that come off the line and are not yet ready to go to the dealership, or from used cars that are trade-ins and need to be stored prior to going to auction.

Kia Motors shall be leasing the garage as the venue to assist in their New Product Delivery and roll out, showcasing all that is Kia.

Kia Motors shall be leasing the roof level of the garage, with its magnificent vistas of both Lake Erie and the Skyline of Cleveland for its photography shoots to be used in all sorts of marketing mediums, which in line will help enhance the City of Cleveland Economic Development efforts.

Kia Motors shall be leasing those parking spaces required to showcase the Kia line of automobile.

Kia Motors shall be leasing the right to install interior messaging mediums to introduce Kia to the vast number of parking clients that park in this garage.

Kia Motors shall be leasing the right to staff the garage with Kia employees for the purpose of continual education on all that is Kia.

All of the above notwithstanding, Kia shall be the largest client that the garage has by a considerable factor. It is for that reason that we have agreed to name the garage after Kia, not unlike the owners of the structures outlined in 2.3 above.

3.2 Automotive Garage – Automotive Partner

Although most, if not all of the Cleveland garages are named something unrelated to the primary use and purpose of the garage (i.e. an automobile facility, as opposed to a bank), our garage will have a direct connection between its use and the name of the garage itself.

SECTION 4: SUMMARY

4.1 Summary

This proposal clearly outlines the need for the installation of a Weather Shield and the beautification reasons for the patterns and designs of the shield. Furthermore, this proposal clearly demonstrates the need of an Identification Sign on the garage, and the reasons as to why the name was chosen. Furthermore, it cannot be mistaken or misclassified that the name of the garage is in fact affiliated to a major tenant and therefore must be considered on-site.

This type of signage should be granted to this property due to its unique structural design that currently can not mitigate or protect the building from the weather elements it faces due to its proximity to Lake Erie. The proposed signage will take the otherwise nameless unknown, blighted garage from its existing condition to the same level that all the other garages in the city current enjoy and would significantly improve an otherwise stale image, would create an additional focal point or point of reference to this area of downtown, and reflects a significant business relationship between the property owner and its Lead Tenant.