Urban Design Principles and Development Guidelines

July 2004

Garrett Square Revitalization Strategy

Prepared for the Garrett Square Economic Development Corporation by Urban Design Center of Northeast Ohio,
City of Cleveland
Councilman Kevin Conwell, Ward 9
Fred Collier, City Planning Department
George Gilliam, Department of Community Development
Tamiko Parker, Department of Economic Development
Courtney McClain, Department of Economic Development

City of East Cleveland
Councilor Barbara Thomas, Ward 2
Paul Beno, Director, Department of Community Development
Glenn Smith, Economic Development Manager

Garrett Square Economic Development Corporation
Marian Grayson, Board Chair
Leslie Conwell, Executive Director
Augustus Thompson

Garrett Square Revitalization Strategy Steering Committee
Heading up the process, the Steering Committee provided project overview, review and guidance throughout the development of the project.

Members of the Steering Committee included the following:
- Willie Austin        Venita Bentley
- Shirley Hawk        Pearl Jackson
- Hazel Johnson       James Kelly
- Larry McBee         Chris Onder
- David Phillips      Yvonne Pointer
- Sherree Ray         Hildreth Walker
- Lemand Williams     

In addition the planning effort has involved significant resident and other stakeholder participation to develop a plan that reflects the community’s vision for the area. The planning team are deeply grateful to all those who made a contribution during the public meetings.
Purpose of this Document

The translation of the VISION into REALITY through a positive approach to the control of development

By putting forward a clear and constructive outline of their policy for general guidance, the City of Cleveland and the Garrett Square Economic Development Corporation are establishing a firm basis of understanding between prospective developers and the committees and officials having responsibility for control and approval. All must surely gain through this initiative.

Design guidelines and the design review process can reduce the time required for a developer to obtain permission to proceed with a project. At the same time, they can ensure that the desired elements of the existing environment are maintained and enhanced, and that new development contributes to the high quality of the neighborhood.

Design review is a controversial subject. If there is no consensus about what constitutes good design, how can a public body review buildings and decide when a design is right or wrong? Many people would say that they know good design when they see it, but it is much easier to conduct a design review when some articulated standards or guidelines have been published in advance.

Without guidelines, the review process often degenerates into a confrontation. A building has been designed and is fairly far along in the design process, otherwise there would be nothing to review. The architecture embodies a whole series of systematic and financial decisions. A simple-sounding suggestion (why not set the building forward 10 feet or why can’t the roof line be somehow different?) can have a sweeping impact for an already developed design. All too often a compromise involves both sides giving a little, with a result that is worse than the original design or the review board’s original suggestion.

Design guidelines must recognize that each project, whether the preservation or adaptive reuse of an existing building or the development of a new building, has a specific set of problems and priorities, of schedules and budgets.

Design guidelines must therefore be presented in ways that encourage projects to proceed and yet at the same time offer incentives and guidance in fitting with the special quality of the neighborhood. They must:

- Identify the most critical design issues.
- Identify the purpose and intent of the guidelines.
- Create a user-friendly document that clearly illustrates each design guideline.
- Create a document that can be easily distributed.
- Create guidelines that are consistent with the City’s plans (comprehensive plan, zoning plan, etc) or identify changes that may be necessary.
- Encourage high-quality design.

For developers, planners, and designers, guidelines should explain the context within which design changes will take place and outline the area’s significant characteristics. For property owners, guidelines should help to ensure that future design changes in the Garrett Square neighborhood will enhance the value of existing property. For the community, guidelines should increase the chance that the quality of the local urban environment will be maintained and enhanced for future generations.

The challenge is to determine the amount and the scope of design intervention. We have sought to achieve a balance between regulatory control, incentives, and design guidance that positively shapes the future of the community in a way that is mutually supportive to all who participate in the development of Garrett Square.
Why do we need them?
Design guidelines provide everyone involved in the rehabilitation of an existing building or the development and design of a new building with a clear set of parameters concerning design in Garrett Square. The guidelines:

- describe the district’s special urban character.
- avoid inappropriate development detrimental to adjacent property owners.
- promote aesthetically-appropriate design strategies for restoration, adaptive reuse, and new construction.

These design guidelines, therefore,

- Describe the vision for the neighborhood that has evolved through a series of public meeting and a number of meetings with a citizens’ steering committee who have guided the development of these design guidelines throughout the process.

- Help to ensure that development along Superior Avenue in the Garrett Square Economic Development boundaries is compatible with existing retail and supports the neighborhood as a whole. This will maximize the economic vitality of the entire neighborhood without having a detrimental impact on any of the individual pieces.

- Promote aesthetically appropriate architectural design strategies for restoration, adaptive reuse, and new construction. Show the preferred range of design intervention, provide discussion and graphic illustration of existing architectural characteristics, and demonstrate graphically how restoration, reinterpretation, or new development can be integrated into the neighborhood to improve the overall urban environment.
Through extensive discussions with the Steering Committee and the property owners, tenants, and residents who attended the public workshops, four primary goals have been established for the Garrett Square corridor along Superior Avenue between East 110th Street at the western end of the neighborhood in Cleveland and the railroad underpass at the eastern end of the neighborhood in East Cleveland. Each of these goals was further developed into a series of more specific objectives.

**Goal 1:**
**Maximize the economic development potential of Garrett Square along the Superior Avenue corridor.**
- Encourage private, market-driven development that relies of minimal intervention of the City.
- Encourage the concentration of retail uses in specific sections of the corridor to create a stronger sense of order and identity and to maximize the pedestrian shopping traffic.
- Promote a higher density of residential development outside of the core retail area to create new living opportunities in the area.

**Goal 2:**
**Enhance the visual character of the environment.**
- Break up the apparent length of the corridor by creating sub-areas of different visual character and of concentrations of similar uses.
- Create a sense of “gateway” at key entries to the corridor including the East 110th Street entry from the west and the railroad underpass from the east.
- Improve the visual character of the corridor by introducing additional plantings along the street, particularly in those areas identified for concentrated residential and institutional uses.
- Control the placement and scale of buildings to create a more continuous development edge on both sides of Superior Avenue and a stronger sense of identity for each area.
- Create a focus for the neighborhood that can give identity to the Garrett Square neighborhood as a citywide attraction.
- Coordinate signage design and architectural and landscape treatments to reinforce the identity of the sub-areas while at the same time creating a strong visual image of the Garrett Square neighborhood as a whole.
Goal 3: Improve the vehicular and pedestrian circulation, particularly in the retail core.
- Align entrances and exits along side streets where possible to allow convenient traffic flow between parking lots without having to use Superior Avenue.
- Establish shared parking regulations to minimize the total number of parking spaces required in the corridor without compromising customer convenience.
- Promote pedestrian movement between uses with comfortable, safe, and attractive sidewalks.
- Minimize conflicts between vehicles and pedestrians by creating access to parking areas from side streets and, where possible, eliminating driveways on Superior Avenue.
- Install a bike path and bicycle storage racks through the area to facilitate the use of bicycles.

Goal 4: Protect and enhance the residential quality of the area.
- Protect and enhance the single-family housing adjacent to the corridor from any negative impacts of commercial development.
- Increase the residential density along the corridor, particularly outside of the core retail area to increase the local resident population and to improve the viability of the retail environment.
- Expand the range of housing types available in the area to include townhouses, live/work units, and apartments in mixed use buildings.
Component Parts of Garrett Square/Superior Avenue
The Superior Avenue corridor of Garrett Square can be subdivided into four districts. Each district has its own character and development challenges. At the same time, however, the districts are integrally linked to establish an overall identifiable and cohesive environment. This image presents the “face” to the residential neighborhoods behind the band of development that lines both the north and south edges of Superior Avenue.
The Pedestrian-Oriented Street

Concept:
The spirit of a community is revealed in its public places and kept alive by the interactions of its citizens. Neighborhood retail brings people together and encourages community interaction. Successful retail fosters strolling, mingling, dining, laughing, relaxing, and playing.

Connections generate more efficiency and diversity through the exchange of activities, information, and ideas. Connections produce possibilities for a new type of development in this area – a rich mixing of convenience retail, residential, institutional, and office uses all located in close proximity to rapid transit giving convenient access to the Greater Cleveland region.

Objectives:
• To create a retail heart to the neighborhood that complements “The Square” with higher density pedestrian-oriented mixed-use development.
• To grow a strong vital neighborhood retail core that builds on and takes its character from the existing stock of historic buildings along the street.
• To build on the existing mixed-use character of the area with new residential, office and service functions that support the retail core.

Strategy:
Concentrate neighborhood shopping and entertainment in the heart of the neighborhood that builds upon the historic character of the existing buildings to create a lively and vital mixed-use environment. Promote diverse activities with a continuous retail edge at the street level with offices or residential units on the second floor.

Rehabilitate existing buildings and develop vacant lots to create an environment that attracts people from Cleveland, East Cleveland, and University Circle, creating a vital economic district and adding to the diversity of activities in the district.

Increase density to support street level retailing.

Actions:
Establish incentives (financial assistance, brokering, etc.) for retailers operating elsewhere in the corridor to relocate to this district.

Work with the City of Cleveland to establish a high-quality streetscape with improved lighting, signage, paving, and street furniture. Work with the City of East Cleveland to supplement the roadway improvements with improved streetscape improvements, signage, and gateway markers.

Develop parking at the rear of the retail uses. Encourage parking areas to be seen as an opportunity for shoppers to explore the entire retail area rather than being for the sole use of a specific store.

Consider supplementing existing zoning regulations with a Pedestrian Retail Overlay Zone to provide more control over development character.

Work with City of East Cleveland to promote the residential/office neighborhood.

Improve the pedestrian sidewalks under the railroad overpass to make them more pedestrian friendly.

Evaluate existing buildings in the district for rehabilitation. Infill vacant sites with two-story buildings accommodating residential/office mixed-uses.

Establish and enforce screening guidelines for parking lots.
Potential:

• New two- or three-story mixed-use buildings with street level retail uses and office or residential uses above.
• Strategically located parking.
• Rehabilitated existing buildings for mixed residential/office/retail uses.
**The Square** at Garrett Square

**Concept:**
As the world around us changes, we turn to the community for social support and cultural stability. Creating places that reveal shared values and foster social exchange is vital to the health of a community.

**Objectives:**
To create an identity for the retail street and a place of destination for residents of the region.

**Strategy:**
Use the geographic focal point of the neighborhood at Superior Avenue, Lakeview Avenue, and East 123rd Street to create a town square.

Reconfigure the intersection to maximize open space, improve traffic patterns, and create a focus for the community.

**Actions:**
Work with the City of Cleveland, Tops Supermarket owners, Hot Sauce Williams, and Sister Raffie’s Restaurant to reconfigure land parcels and traffic patterns in order to accommodate the creation of “The Square.”

Promote the newly created development parcels as a retail space for restaurant and entertainment uses around “The Square.”

Encourage the revitalization and redevelopment of buildings on the east side of Lakeview Avenue and on the south side of Superior Avenue to complete the enclosure of the square and to further support the vitality of the area as a specialty premier eating and entertainment venue for Cleveland.

Create a clear landscaped pedestrian pathway to Tops Supermarket.

Work with Cleveland Public Art to develop an installation in the square to reinforce the Garrett Square identity.

Work with the City of Cleveland to establish a high quality streetscape with improved lighting, signage, paving, and street furniture.

Establish and enforce screening guidelines for parking lots.

**Potential:**
- Single-story restaurants located in front of Tops Supermarket and with drive-through windows at the rear.
- Restaurants and other retail uses at street level in two-story buildings on the east and south sides of the square with office/residential uses above.
- Outdoor eating opportunities.
- Off-street parking.
- “The Square” at Garrett Square.
“The Square” at Garrett Square
Auto-oriented Convenience Retail Area

Concept:
When places within neighborhoods are transformed, new opportunities emerge creating development grounded in the heritage of place that meet the needs of an evolving society. Focusing on specialty retail, restaurants, and entertainment around “The Square” and to the east along Superior Avenue creates opportunities for other types of convenience retail to grow and flourish.

This area is an important transition area from the residential to the retail core. It should serve as a connector and a preview of what is to come next and, while serving the neighborhood as a whole, support the retail activities in the Square

Objectives:
- To recognize the need for some “drive-through” uses along the corridor.

Strategy:
Focus auto-oriented uses that require more space on well-landscaped sites adjacent to the retail core.

Actions:
Work with existing owners to encourage new uses on a limited number of sites on the north side of Superior Avenue to accommodate drive-up businesses.

Work with the City of Cleveland to establish a high-quality streetscape with improved lighting, signage, paving, and street furniture. Establish and enforce screening guidelines for parking lots.

Potential:
- Laundry/Dry Cleaners, gas station, liquor store, and similar convenience uses.
The Gateway Residential Area

Concept:
In the early years of the twentieth century Superior Avenue was a historic transit corridor. The bus stopped at every street corner and small local retail stores provided for most daily needs, producing a pattern of long stretches of urban arterials zoned for retail uses. This pattern of daily use has changed. Much of this land is now vacant and can be put to better use. It affords the opportunity to inject new housing types into the community, broadening the available housing stock and attracting new residents.

Strategy:
Develop the area with two- or three-story housing, particularly on the south side of Superior Avenue together with a small retail convenience center at East 110th Street. Several churches are located on the north side of the street, and these could develop as larger institutional anchors for the neighborhood.

Objectives:
- To create a western gateway to the Garrett Square district at East 105th/110th Street
- To increase the density of housing within walking distance of the retail nodes.
- To expand the range of housing options within the neighborhood.
- To create an environment for institutional uses to grow and flourish while adding stability and character to the neighborhood.
- To physically change the character of Superior Avenue that is experienced by people traveling along the street.

Actions:
- Partner with private residential developers to complete the residential area.
- Work with the City of Cleveland Department of Economic Development and the local Councilman to consolidate land parcels for future development prospects.
- Where appropriate, integrate viable existing uses and renovate historic buildings.
- Work with the City of Cleveland to upgrade streetscape elements including lighting, signage, and gateway markers.
- Establish and enforce screening guidelines for parking lots.

Potential:
- New townhouse units.
- Rehabilitation of existing buildings for residential uses.
- Expansion of existing institutional uses.
- Revitalization of a small number of retail buildings for local convenience retail uses.
The Gateway Residential Environment
Retail districts are comprised of private, semi-public, and public elements. Private spaces within retail districts include building structures, loading and unloading areas, building courtyards, and screened outdoor spaces. Semi-public areas include off-street parking and street-side open courtyards. Public spaces include sidewalks, plazas, on-street parking, and the public street. The goal in designing the retail heart of the neighborhood should be the creation of a retail district that is memorable, attractive, exciting, convenient, and safe.
Gateways

Design Principle:
Establish well-defined boundaries that emphasize the compact density of the Garrett Square retail district.

Encourage a sense of arrival when approaching and a sense of departure when leaving the retail district.

Gateways:
1: The Garrett Square District:
   East 110th Street in Cleveland along Superior Avenue to the rail bridge in East Cleveland.
   The intersection of Lakeview Avenue and Euclid Avenue north along Lakeview Avenue to Phillips Avenue.
2: The Mixed Use/Retail District:
   East 117th Street along Superior Avenue to the rail bridge.

Special gateway signage to mark the boundaries of the district should be installed to give identity to the district. The gateway elements should be integrated with the streetscape and landscape design and be reinforced by subtle elements in the architecture of adjacent buildings or in the landscape treatment and streetscape details.

Further identification may be achieved by a banner program and public art projects, particularly projects to enhance the Superior Avenue Railroad Bridge and to focus attention on the district and on special events and promotions in the area.
“The Square” at Garrett Square

Design Principles

- Create “The Square at Garrett Square” at the intersection of Superior Avenue, Lakeview Avenue, and East 123rd Street.
- Promote the use of the public space as a distinct feature of the Garrett Square neighborhood and encourage uses that contribute to and are consistent with the special character of The Square.

Promote a sense of urban activity within the square that gives identity to Garrett Square. Encourage local cafes and restaurants in The Square. Develop the front of the café so that a set of tables can extend the café out into the square.

Reconfigure the roadway intersection of Lakeview Avenue and Superior Avenue to create a pedestrian oriented public space that contributes to the identity of Garrett Square.

Working with the ownership of the supermarket, establish “build to” lines along the west and northwest edges of “The Square” to complete the enclosure of the square. Maintain a view line from the intersection to the façade of Tops Supermarket and construct a clearly defined pedestrian walkway across the parking lot to the entrance of the supermarket. Encourage improved landscaping of the parking lot, particularly the landscaping, fencing, and screening along the boundaries of the parcel.

The landscape and streetscape elements of “The Square” should be of the highest quality to create a prestigious public space and to provide a setting for public activities in the neighborhood. “The Square” should be programmed for uses such as weekend markets, annual “street days,” national holiday celebrations, special food promotions by the surrounding cafes, etc.

“The Square” could also be the site for public art installations. These could be either free standing art similar to the “traffic light street” shown in the photograph or integral art incorporated into the streetscape details of the square.

Vitality in the public space

Promote the development of new buildings on out-lot building sites on the existing Tops Supermarket parking lot.

Cafes spilling out into the square

Public art “traffic signal”
The Pedestrian-Oriented Street

Design Principle:

- **Require the development of all new buildings and infill development to reinforce the existing historic pattern by building up to the street edge/property line in order to establish a solid edge to the street and to encourage the development of a continuous retail façade along the street.**

  For retail buildings, the setback rule is straightforward: don’t have one. Traditional retail, to be successful, must pull directly up to the sidewalk, so that people can see the merchandise in the window. Parking lots in front are of course forbidden: there is little that is more destructive to pedestrian life. (Duany, Andres, et al. *Suburban Nation*)

The prime underlying principle of all urban streets is the enclosure of space by buildings. If space is not satisfactorily enclosed, an attractive street environment cannot be achieved.

The quality of the Garrett Square neighborhood has much to do with the nature of Superior Avenue. Without guidelines, buildings have been set back from the property line. In other places a number of vacant sites have been created by the demolition of buildings and as a means of increasing parking along the street. To re-establish the quality of the street environment, these sites should be filled with new buildings.

All new buildings in the retail area along Superior Avenue must be constructed on the property line. Recesses that are included to break the continuity of the street façade and create a visual rhythm along the sidewalk are encouraged but should be spaced at least 30 feet apart and should be no more than 4 feet wide and 2 feet deep.
The Pedestrian Oriented Street (continued)

Over time, new development has eroded this pattern resulting in gaps within the urban fabric. New retail uses, resulting from attitudes to the automobile have resulted in buildings being set back from the street with parking placed between the building and the street and in buildings being demolished to provide parking adjacent to the street for use by neighboring property owners. This suburban style pattern of land use and the resultant building type is inappropriate in this inner-city retail neighborhood.

New buildings should establish a solid edge to the street with parking located behind the buildings. This will achieve the following:

- The reinforcement of the pedestrian environment in an area of the city that can attract many people on foot.
- By placing buildings up to the building line, people are placed in close proximity to the stores – the store environment becomes part of the street environment and greater visibility of the retail products are afforded to both pedestrians and passing motorists.
- Strengthen existing retail and reinforce new retail by providing a continuous retail edge that will bring economic advantage to the entire neighborhood. Economic return to the neighborhood as a whole will be harmed if buildings are set back from the street, creating islands of parking immediately adjacent to the street.
- The public investment in streets and sidewalks reaps a greater return by enhancing the retail environment rather than affording views of parking areas. It creates an environment where retail activities can spill out onto the street further adding to the social and civic life of the district and pride in the neighborhood.
- It does not have a negative impact on the development potential.
Patterns of Use

*Design Principles:*

- **Promote mixed-use development throughout the retail street with the development of two storey buildings. Discourage single story, single-use development.**
- **Encourage a variety and intensity of street activity.**
- **Promote a continuous retail use at the pedestrian level with office or residential uses on the upper floor.**
- **Re-establish street level retail continuity by infilling vacant sites.**

Typically the historic pattern of development in the retail area has been one of buildings that fill the parcel on the street edge with buildings having a retail or service use on the first floor. Uses on the upper floors, where present, have been for either office or residential use.

The use and configuration of buildings at the street edge – multiple uses, windows that overlook the street, the presence of entrances into buildings, the activities that are in the buildings particularly those in street-level spaces, and the quality of the streetscape itself – encourage street life. This, in turn, adds to the sense of security and well-being for those using the street and the surrounding buildings.

The first floor frontage of all buildings in the retail area must be active commercial uses, primarily retail and restaurants, but limited service functions that attract walk-in traffic, such as copy centers or travel agencies, are acceptable.
Cross Section of the Street

**Design Principle:**
- *Buildings should be at least two stories in height to establish a sense of street enclosure.*

The relationship between the height of the buildings and the width of the street is important when maintaining a pedestrian oriented environment.

A two-story building (approximately 27 feet high) will give a height to width ratio of 1:3. A three-story building (approximately 40 feet high) will give a height to width ratio of 1:2.

If buildings are too high in relation to the width of the street, a canyon like effect can be created; if too low, there is no sense of enclosure.

The height to width ratio should not be less than 1:3 if a sense of enclosure is to be achieved.
Vehicular and Pedestrian Access

Design Principles:

- Reinforce both vehicular and pedestrian access to the street.
- Off-street parking should be convenient for customers and visitors but its visual impact should be minimized.
- Provide clear pedestrian links from the parking area to the street and retail establishments.
- Screen and fence parking lots.

Parking should be provided behind the building and accessible from adjacent side streets. Parking on the street edge between the building and the street dramatically reduces the character of the street and interrupts pedestrian flow along the street.

Adoption of the City of Cleveland Pedestrian Retail Overlay District is encouraged. The Overlay District establishes a lower parking requirement in pedestrian oriented retail districts and also encourages a district approach to parking rather than every development parcel providing parking for its exclusive use. This approach encourages pedestrian movement throughout the street and increases the vitality and activity of the area.
Landscape Buffers

*Design Principles:*

- Buffer the surrounding residential neighborhood properties from retail business uses.
- All service and trash containers must be screened from view through the use of evergreen plant material, or masonry walls, or timber screens compatible with the building design.

The edge of parking lots along the side streets should be visually screened with fencing and landscape elements. Parking should be setback 10 feet from the property line. Adequate lighting should be installed to maintain security.
Off-street Parking

All parking that cannot be handled on the street can be provided by mid-block lots that are hidden behind buildings. (Duany, Andres, et al. Suburban Nation).

Design Principles:

- **Access to parking areas should be from the side streets.** Access directly from Superior Avenue should be avoided wherever possible.
- **Existing parking lots should be consolidated with adjacent lots to create convenient, safe, and attractive vehicle parking that does not dominate or detract from the continuity of shopping or working in the area.**
- **Screen parking areas from the street**
- **Landscape parking areas to improve the appearance, to cut down heat gain, and to provide shade.**

Consideration should be given to the consolidation of off-street parking for use by the neighborhood as a whole rather than for individual lots for each property. Shared parking arrangements can recognize shifting times of peak demand for different uses and create a more efficient parking arrangement.

The screening of parking lots should include at least ten feet of landscaped strip between the vehicle area and the sidewalk with a 36” high screening element of either a dense hedge, a wall, or a fence integrated with shrub planting.

Where vacant lots abutting Superior Avenue currently exist, and prior to any development taking place on the sites, a similar screen and planting as a temporary measure should be put in place.

All parking lots should have a minimum of six feet wide curbed islands at the end of every row of parking. The islands should be equal to the parking space length. There should be a minimum of one shade tree per island or two trees per island where opposite bays align. No parking stall within the lot should be more than forty feet (40’) or ten car spaces from a tree. Landscape planting within the area between the vehicle area and the building is recommended.
Streetscape Elements

Design Principle:

- Coordinate the design and placement of all streetscape elements and ensure high-quality elements throughout the District.
- Adapt a public art program to add a special flavor to the area and to make the place memorable.
- Install wayfinding and information signs to increase public understanding of the heritage of the neighborhood.

Crosswalks
Easy access across Superior Avenue is important in the neighborhood and pedestrian crossings should be frequent and clearly marked. They are a traffic-calming device that contributes to the pedestrian experience and comfort.

Paving
The paving material used for “The Square” should extend across Superior Avenue and Lakeview Avenue to emphasize the special character of the place and to continue to express the need for traffic calming in the neighborhood.

Lighting
Pedestrian-scale street lights should be installed along Superior Avenue as part of the streetscape upgrading. The lighting and design standard set by these lights should be extended onto the cross streets and parking areas.

Banners
Banners on light poles are an extremely effective way of adding interest and drawing attention to special events in the neighborhood. However, to be effective, banners must be maintained and changed at regular intervals to reflect seasonal changes or special events that are planned for the District.
Existing, Infill, and New Buildings

Design Principles:
• **Encourage the maintenance and reinvestment in existing private buildings that contribute to the quality of the retail district.**
• **Preserve the integrity of historic buildings that physically express the history of Garrett Square and contribute to an understanding of Garrett Square as a “community” and of its development over time.**
• **Insure that all new buildings and building improvements are compatible with the overall retail character of the street.**

New infill development along the street façade should maintain and reinforce the line of the storefronts at the sidewalk edge, therefore maintaining the integrity of the street facades. The height to width proportion of the street is the most important factor.

The continuity of the street edge retail façade is a paramount importance. A “missing tooth” situation is a negative image and has an impact on both the quality of the physical environment and the economic environment for other retail activities along the street.

User friendly and interesting pedestrian retail activity should occupy the street level of all new infill development.

The facades of infill development should reinforce the established horizontal lines of the facades of adjacent buildings on the street. The general alignment of building heights should reinforce the two or three story height proposed for all buildings in the district.

Parking for a particular new infill development should be part of the collective parking area behind the building. Once parking areas are known to users, they will continue to use them. Street signage on Superior Avenue should direct newcomers to the parking areas.
Street Facades

**Design Principles:**

- **Major facades and entrances to buildings should face Superior Avenue and on to “The Square.” Access to service bays and parking should be from the cross streets.**
- **The architectural composition of building elevations should express a base, middle, and top articulation on all street facades.**

Buildings in the Garrett Square district were traditionally organized by the pattern of streets and blocks. Buildings in this traditional pattern have fronts and backs. The fronts face the street and form the major public entrances. While recognizing that some entrances will be required directly into buildings from the parking areas, new buildings should acknowledge this orientation to the traditional clarity of public street fronts and secondary back access.

One of the tenets of architectural composition is the idea of a building having a base, middle, and top. Buildings along Superior Avenue should clearly display this characteristic.

The top of the building terminates the building against the sky: the middle abstractly communicates the building’s function and use, and the base firmly anchors the building to the ground at the same time as presenting a close-range interface with people.

The transition between the base and the middle or between the middle and the top are often articulated by the use of contrasting materials or ornamental projecting elements. These horizontal bands on buildings form “expression lines” that give scale and character to the façade. They become important clues for new buildings on adjacent sites.

Windows on the upper floors should fit within the structural bays of the building.
Variety and Use

**Design Principles:**
- *The street level frontage of all buildings must be active, commercial uses, primarily retail and restaurants, but limited service functions that attract walk-in traffic, such as copy services and travel agents are also acceptable.*

There is no predominant architectural style in the existing buildings in the district. In some cases, styles are mixed within the composition of a single building. There is, however, a more general level of similarity. Most structures are of masonry construction, predominantly brick. Construction methods and plot sizes controlled the structural rhythm and structural pattern of floors, walls, and columns.

Openings on upper floors tended to be small as if punched into the masonry façade. This pattern of construction should be recognized. Proposed new buildings should respect this heritage without mimicking any particular existing building or style.

Following the guidelines contained within this document should lead to new buildings that fit comfortably into the district and yet express their own individuality and time.
Storefronts

Design Principles:
- At least 60% of the total area of the first floor façade facing Superior Avenue and the public square at Garrett Avenue should be window displays.
- Walls exposed to side streets must have doors, windows or fixed glazing areas of at least 30% of the total surface area of the wall facing the street.

Large windows and attractive window displays create a welcome ambience in a retail district and add interest to the pedestrian experience.

New or altered entries to building and storefronts should have a visual richness of detail to add interest to the base of the building – that area closest to the passing pedestrian.

The storefront is defined as that part of the building that fills the structural bay on the front façade at ground level. Storefronts face the principal street. If a building is located on a corner lot, storefronts may be on both street faces, however the principal storefront should be on the principal street.

Storefronts shall typically consist of a base (the area under the window and usually opaque), the transparent window, a transom above the window, and a storefront cornice.
Building Signs

Design Principle:
- Exterior signs should be located within the base of the building with concern for the appropriateness of location, size, color, and lighting.

Sign message are typically intended to be viewed by motorists and pedestrians and should be geared to establish the location, identity, and character of the use of the retail establishment.

Sign ordinances are complex and can lead to an oversimplification of the potential visual excitement of a retail district. Signs are an integral part of the retail character of the district. At the same time, the lack of any control can lead to visual chaos.

The intent of these guidelines is to allow for variety within some controlling parameters.

The base of the building is the most visible part of the building both to pedestrians and to motorists. To be effective, signs must call attention to the business and create an individual image for the store. But signs also contribute to the overall image of a district, adding variety and liveliness to both building facades and to streetscapes. A thematic approach included such commonly shared qualities as sign message, location, size, color, and lighting.

Sign message
Businesses should only include the formal name of the business, the nature of the business, and the address. There should be no advertising of brand names. Avoid an accumulation of outdated service club affiliations, credit card decals, and other sign clutter.

Building signs should include the name of the building and the street address. Professional office buildings may list the occupants of the building. There is an appropriate location for each of these different sign messages.
Location and Size
Signs shall be located on the spandrel panels of the building immediately above the storefront, within the transom of the door or storefront, on door or window glass, on wall areas adjacent to the door, on the skirt of awnings, or on projecting signs hung within the base zone of the building.

Spandrel panel signs
The size of signs on the spandrel panel shall be such that they can be contained within the structural bay of the building, but shall not exceed 20 feet in width. The height of the sign shall be no more than 75% of the height of the spandrel panel.

Transom Panel signs
The Transom areas above the door or display windows shall not be covered by opaque signs or panels. If the transom is broken down into a number of smaller panels, sign location should respect and not obscure the individual panels. Signs in the transom area shall not exceed 65% of the width of the panel or 75% of the height of the panel. The height of letters shall not exceed 18 inches.

Display window signs
Display window signs applied directly to the glass shall consist only of lettering without an opaque background. On the display window, such a sign shall not cover more than one-fifth of the area of the glass panel.

Window signs should not obscure the display area. The color of letters should contrast with the display background. Light colored letters or gold leafed letters with dark borders are effective.

Temporary signs in windows are not allowed except under limited conditions for short periods of time.
Banners and projecting signs
Projecting signs shall be mounted on the structural piers of the building. They shall be no lower than 8’6” and no higher than the base of the building or 14 feet, whichever is lower. Hanging signs shall project no more than three feet from the face of the building. Brackets and other methods of attachment shall be considered part of the design proposal and should be designed to be sensitively compatible with the building.

All projecting signs should be externally lit. External light sources should be shielded from viewers on the street to prevent glare.

No backlit, flashing, or moving signs are permitted.

Awning signs
Signs of awning shall have contrasting letters painted or sewn onto the valance or skirt of the awning. Usually six to eight inch letters are sufficient. Letters on the main, sloping area of the awning are not permitted.

Temporary advertising signs
Temporary advertising signs, sale signs, lease signs, etc. attached to the building and display windows should be limited to 30 days of display time.

Style and size of letters
There are many letter styles available. A letter style should be chosen that is easy to read and that represents the image of the business it is presenting. The maximum height of letters shall not exceed 75% of the height of the background on which they appear.

Illumination
No backlit, flashing, or moving signs are permitted.

Rooftop signs
Signs are not allowed on rooftops or projecting above the roof.
Awnings, Canopies, and Marquees

**Design Principle:**
- **Canopies and awnings shall reflect the door and window openings or structural bays of the building.**

All awnings shall be of the traditional sloped configuration. Curved, vaulted, or semi-spherical awnings are not permitted.

An exception to this rule will be made for barrel-vaulted awnings over building entrances that project perpendicular to the building out to the curb edge.

Awnings shall be made of canvas or Neoprene impregnated fabric. Vinyl awnings are not permitted.

The underside of awnings shall be open to expose the structure. Soffit panels are not permitted.

Internal lighting is not permitted.

Pseudo-mansard roofs are not permitted.

Surface Treatment and External Finishes

**Design Principle:**
- **Building materials should be compatible with the character of the District.**

To complement the existing character of retail buildings in Garrett Square, brick is the preferred building material, with sandstone, granite or pre-cast concrete accents in lintels, window sills, or the base of piers. Metal panels may be used as decorative accents but not as the primary building material. Drivit, wood paneling, vinyl siding and faux stone are not acceptable materials on the street façade.

On elevations not facing the street or the public space, painted wood or stucco may be used in place of brick.

In existing structures, when repairing or replacing deteriorating materials with new materials, every effort should be made to duplicate the old as closely as possible.

Any cleaning of existing structures should be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and chemical cleaning methods, which can damage the surface of materials, should not be used.
Ornamentation and Trim

*Design Principle:*

- **On all new construction, surface ornamentation should be an integral part of the design and should enhance the visual richness of the street facade.**

On most new construction, ways should be found to enrich surface treatments that take advantage of modern production techniques and accept current labor costs.

Some possible approaches include:
- Expressing structural elements rather than hiding them.
- For close range interest, use materials with inherent surface interest.
- When using mass-produced components, consider the full range available before selection.

Recycle craft skills and re-use elements from the past.

Painting/Color Palette

*Design Principle:*

- **The painting of major street facades is not recommended.**

Brick, stone, and concrete elements should be selected in colors that complement each other and these materials should never be painted.

In general, strong colors should be reserved for signage, awnings, and door and window trims rather than the building itself.
Pedestrian Retail Overlay District

A zoning ordinance change should be considered to designate the Garrett Square Retail District a Pedestrian Retail Overlay District (PRO). This designation will ensure that the pedestrian-oriented character of the District is maintained and enhanced.

The PRO District focus is to encourage the development of a neighborhood shopping district characterized by retail building located at the sidewalk edge.

To accomplish this, the following regulatory tools are incorporated in the ordinance.

- **Permitted Uses** – The PRO District permits mixing of uses in a single structure or site, currently precluded by zoning ordinance except in Planned Unit Developments.

- **Building Setback** – The PRO District requires any new building to be built in the designated Building Zone with the street façade of the building built on the property line with no setback from the sidewalk.

- **Parking Location** – Any parking lot proposed for a location directly along the Pedestrian Retail Street, for example, parking on the side of a building as opposed to in the parking zone at the back of the building zone, is classified as a “Conditional Use” in the PRO District. Such a parking lot will not be approved unless the City Planning Commission determines that it is not feasible to locate the parking behind the building.

- **Prohibited Uses** – The PRO District permits those uses permitted in the underlying district but would prohibit certain uses that detract from the pedestrian-oriented character of the District. These prohibited uses include open sales lots (automobile dealers, etc.), gas stations, car washes, and drive-through lanes that open onto the pedestrian retail street.

- **Conditional Uses** – The PRO District classifies certain uses as “Conditional Uses.” Conditional uses are permitted only if the City Planning Commission determines that a more suitable use could not reasonably be located on a particular property. Conditional uses would include housing, institutions (such as churches and schools) and offices that do not serve customers or clients on the premises – except that such uses would be permitted, and in fact encouraged, on upper floors.

- **Required Parking** – Recognizing that a greater than average proportion of customers will be walking in the retail district, either as residents of the surrounding neighborhoods or as visitors to the retail district as a whole, the PRO District allows developers to reduce parking requirements by 33% compared to the otherwise applicable zoning requirements. The PRO District regulations also permit the further reduction of the off-street parking requirements where it can be demonstrated that additional parking is available in common or shared parking facilities or in on-street parking areas.